



# Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey's studies on less used makams

Özlem Elitaş<sup>a \*</sup>, Emel Funda Türkmen<sup>b</sup>

<sup>a</sup> Afyon Kocatepe University, Graduate School of Social Sciences, Campus, Afyonkarahisar, 03200, Turkey

<sup>b</sup> Çanakkale Onsekiz Mart University, State Conservatory, Campus, Çanakkale, 17100, Turkey

## Abstract

Witnessing the last periods of the Ottoman Empire and the first years of the Republic, Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey, like some great composers in the history of Turkish music, made important works to ensure that these *makams* are not forgotten by producing new works from *makams* that he noticed were rarely used in his lifetime. This study aims to draw attention to the rarely used *makams* preferred by Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey, who composed works in many forms of Turkish music, and his works in the classical *fasıl* completion tradition. The study is considered important in terms of revealing the composer's effort to transfer the cultural memory of music. In the study, document analysis was made using the literature review method and the works of Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey in the TRT (Turkish Radio and Television) Repertoire were examined. It has been determined that it mostly includes rarely used *makams* and it has been tried to determine the rate of use of these *makams* in the repertoire with numerical data. In addition, the classical *fasıl* completion works in Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey's understanding of composition were mentioned and the efforts of the composer to preserve the connection between the past and the future were emphasized.

**Keywords:** Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey; composer; Turkish music; less used makam

© 2016 IJCI & the Authors. Published by *International Journal of Curriculum and Instruction (IJCI)*. This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (CC BY-NC-ND) (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>).

## 1. Introduction

Turkish music differs from many traditional music, especially in terms of *makam* and *usûl* (rhythm) richness. The fact that the makam element in Turkish music is decisive has played a leading role in calling this music "makam music" today (Ayangil, 2015). Contrary to the general trend, makams do not consist of scales, but "tones with their own integrity and personality" (Tura, 2006: 35). These tunes (hence the related pitches that make up the tunes) have been taught through meşk for hundreds of years (Behar, 2019:

\* Corresponding author name. ORCID ID.: <https://orcid.org/0000-0000-0000-0000>  
E-mail address: [author@institution.xxx](mailto:author@institution.xxx)

17). Because perhaps none of the music scripts that have been used many times throughout history have been sufficient to convey the performed music completely. For this reason, the meşk system, which allows direct oral transmission from master to apprentice, has been the source of theory works for hundreds of years.

For this reason, many authors during the Ottoman period used expressions such as "they say about such and such a makam" or "the old masters say this to this makam". It is possible to see similar expressions in Abdülbâkî Nâsır Dede's description of the uşşâk makam, and the expression "this makam is what the later ones call nevâ and the old people call it nevrz-ı asl" (Aksu, 1988: 163; Tura, 2006: 39) can be given as an example of such an expression.

It is clear that an ancient musical tradition, in which 12 basic makams and hundreds of new makams were produced over time with "endless terkîb(combination)" (Tura, 2001: 47), underwent a change that started to be noticed with the Tanzimat reform period and became more evident in the Republican period. It is possible to see the clear reflections of this change in the recent compositions recorded in the TRT repertoire. For example, 72% of the works registered in the TRT Turkish Classical Music repertoire were composed of only 20 makams (Çevikoğlu, 2017: 21).

At this point, the continuity of the tradition as well as the efforts and efforts of Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey on innovation are considered important. The outstanding efforts he made to reveal the makams that were not used during his lifetime can be easily recognized from the works he composed and the artistic activities he carried out for the performance of these works.

Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey, who lived at the end of the 19th century and the first years of the 20th century, witnessed the effects of this "transition" period in almost every aspect of life (Kaygusuz, 2006: 9). On the one hand, he was among the important representatives of the tradition with his teaching, composition and works in the field of musicology, and on the other hand, he contributed to the production of music with an understanding suitable for the conditions of the period in which he lived.

### *1.1. Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey (1866-1927)*

Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey, who was born in the Molla-aşki neighborhood of Balat in Istanbul, is the son of Hânende Raşid Efendi, who was a civil servant in the Idâre-i Mahsûsa (state steamboat management office) (Öztuna, 1990: 402). He was taken to Mızıkâ-yı Hümâyûn (the imperial band/orchestra of the Ottoman Empire) as a student at the age of thirteen (İnal, 2019: 213). He received Turkish music education from Suyolcu Latif Ağa and learned European music and notation from M. Zati Bey and for a short time from Guatelli Pasha. He also knows the Hamparsum note (Özalp, 1986: 34). After finishing his education, he worked as a sultan's muezzin and led the palace fasıl

committee as a serhânende in Mızıka-yı Hümâyûn. He used the traditional methods applied in Turkish music in the fasıl delegations and directed the ensembles in this way (Behar, 1993: 122). Kamsoy, in his article in the journal "Musiki ve Nota (Music and Note)", mentioned that a good director is needed to ensure the unity of performance in large ensembles, and cited Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey as the first director of Turkish music (1971: 24).

Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey became a well-known composer and fasıl conductor at the age of 42 and rose to the rank of lieutenant colonel (district governor) (Öztuna, 1990: 402). He worked as a music muallim at Darü'l-irfân School between 1902 and 1905, became the second director of the first music society, Dârü'l-Musiki-i Osmanî Society, in 1909, and then the first musical society in 1910. He founded the Mûsikî-i Osmanî School, which is recorded as a private music school (Güçtekin, 2014: 2-4). He served as a member of the "Classification and Determination Committee", a fasıl chief and a solfeggio teacher at the Dârü'l-elhân education institution opened under the supervision of Ziya Pasha in 1917 (Özalp, 1986: 34). It is known that he received the title of " Muallim " because he trained many students. Names such as Hafız Yaşar Okur, Hasan Tahsin Parsadan, Âmâ Nâzım Bey, Nûri Halil Poyraz, İzzeddin Hümayî Elçioğlu, Fehmi Tekçe, Hayri Yenigün, Nigar Galip Ulusoy, Fahri Kopuz, Faize Ergin, Vecihe Daryal, Zeki Arif Ataergin, Mustafa Sagar and Ali Rıza were among his students and these names became the leading names of Turkish music in the following years (Güntekin, 2010: 71).

Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey was among the founders of the Istanbul Operetta Delegation, which was established in 1919, directed this ensemble by establishing classical Turkish music instruments ensemble, and composed makam operettas (Aksoy, 1985: 1234). Gazimihal (1928) stated in his article in the Milli Mecmua that he closely followed Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey's work on writing operettas with classical Turkish music instruments ensemble, and the name "şarkılı oyun" (musical stage play) was used instead of the name "operet" (Duran, 2001: 184-185). It has been stated that Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey has made remarkable efforts in the history of Turkish operetta, and the operettas he composed are among the most important works in the history of Turkish operetta (Güntekin, 2010: 71). When the personal archive of Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey is examined, there are 16 recorded operettas that he composed, their names are Bülbül, Lale Devri, Kaşıkçılar, Damat İbrahim Paşa, Yedekçi, Kiracılar, Nuru's-Sabah, Emel, Gazanfer, İyi Saatte Olsunlar, Gelin Kaynana, Falcı, Tutkun, Mine'l-Garaib, Şebnem, Binbir Direk.

Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey composed works in the form of duanâme, as well as religious musical forms such as ilahi, tevşih, ilahi cumhur, şugul and durak. In a study on the duanâme form, it is stated that this form is expressed as a kind of eulogy and prayer composed of poems written for the head of state, and that it was composed mostly for the sultans of the period. In the study, it is stated that 21 duanâme were composed

during the reign of Sultan Abdülhamid II, and 8 duanâme among these works belong to Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey (Tıraşçı, 2014: 296-304). Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey also composed the Hebrew lyrics given to him by the Jews to be read in the synagogues (Yenigün, 1971: 13). It is reported that there are notes of various compilations such as National Anatolian fasıls, Azerbaijani, Bulgarian, Turkish, zeybek, laz songs, Jewish, Christian, and Muslim hymns in his music book (Kaygusuz, 2006: 15-29). Gazimihal (2017: 74) mentioned that Mûsikî-i Osmanî Mektebi published several Jewish, Circassian, Greek and Kurdish folk songs among the notes.

Bardakçı, in his article in the Habertürk Newspaper dated March 3, 2019, about the "mücavir songs" notebook written by Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey, stated that Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey described the word "mücavir", which he used to mean the nations that made up the Ottoman Empire and the regions where these nations lived, as "neighbourhood with each other", and mentioned this notebook, which contains the works in Turkish, Arabic, Kurdish, Laz, Persian, Greek, Armenian, Bosnian, Vlach, Jewish and other languages that he composed from the lyrics in the languages of neighbouring nations, he stated that the lyrics were written in other languages and in ancient letters. Gazimihal (1928) stated that before Darü'l-elhân's works, the person who "folk song compiler" the most was Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey, and he performed the first paid historical concerts by listening to the people outside the palace (Duran, 2001: 186).

There are many types of marches among the forms composed by Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey. It is reported that E. Ruhi Üngör defined Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey's anthems as "number one" among march composers who composed "extraordinarily melodic" (Kaygusuz, 2006: 11). Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey composed the National Anthem as well as the anthems such as "Our army took oath, O glorious army, glorious soldier". He participated in the competition opened on March 12, 1921 for the composition of the national anthem with the composition of the National Anthem that he composed in the râst makam. The composition of Ali Rıfat Çağatay, who was among the competitors in the committee formed by the Ministry of Education in 1924, was accepted as the official anthem (Çetin, 2014: 36).

It is reported that Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey composed a new makam called "mahûrhân", and besides this, he composed new styles and brought them to Turkish music. The methods (usûl) that Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey composed were "ağırlama (9-timed usûl), devr-i kurdî (14-timed usûl), kazancılar düyeği (4-timed usûl), mevlevi evferi (9-timed usûl), nazlı düyek (12-timed usûl)", raks semâî (18-timed usûl)" (Kaygusuz, 2006: 21).

The works of Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey, which he wrote in the field of theory and music education, and his works that show the value he gives to musical notation are remarkable. According to Kaygusuz, who translated Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey's book "Mûsikî Tekâmül Dersleri" into contemporary Turkish, reported that there is a 184-page

fasıl publication named Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey's Mahzen-i Esrâr-ı Mûsikî (treasury of music secrets) or Teğanniyât-ı Osmanî (Istanbul 1313/1895) but not all of them have reached the present day. The works cited as the first and second books are given below.

First Book: Usulât, Solfej, Makamât ve İlaveli Nota Dersleri (ed. Kazmanizâde Şamlı İskender), İstanbul: Haşim matbaası, (1341/1925).

It is reported that the long name on the outer cover of the first book, which consists of 158 pages, is Usulat, Solfej, *Makamat and Additional Note Lessons by Mahzen-i Esrâr-ı Mûsikî Owner Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey*, and *Solfeggio: Note Lessons* on the inside cover. It is recorded that this work was later published by Şamlı İskender under the name *Turkish Music Note, Usul, Makamat and Solfej Method* (1940?) in Latin letters (2006: 21).

Second Book: Mûsikî Tekâmül Dersleri (ed. Kazmanizâde Şamlı İskender), İstanbul: Galata Feniks printing house, (1926).

At the beginning of this book, the names of 4 *terkib*, 12 makams, and 7 *âvâze*, which are also used in the traditional makam classification, are stated, and the course of 98 makams is briefly explained in the book. Of the 98 makams in the book, 80 are classified as makam, 14 as makam, and 4 as *âvâze*. For the *şûbe*, there are expressions such as "dugâh, yegâh" or "from the *şûbe*" (Kaygusuz, 2006: 17).

Özalp stated that Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey took the surname "Aksoy" after the "Law of Surnames" and that he died of a heart attack on December 30, 1927, at the age of 61, on the way from Dârü'l-elhân to his home in Bebek (1986: 34), while Aksüt reported that Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey died on 11 December 1927 and was buried in Eğrikapı Cemetery next to Saka Baba from Bektaşî on 14 December (1993: 278). The fact that a cartoon about Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey's funeral took place in Akbaba magazine on 15 December 1927 (Bardakçı, 2017: 359; Konan, 2020: 69) shows that the information given by Aksüt may be correct. According to this, it is understood that Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey passed away before 15 December. Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey's body was carried along with Chopin's funeral march, the recitations of the Qur'an by the hafız and the mersiye by the rabbis, and Gazimihal commemorated Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey as the first Turkish music composer to be taken to the grave with a brass band (Kaygusuz, 2006: 6).

The fact that Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey uses a modern approach as well as traditionalism in his works, giving importance to both form and makam diversity and focusing on the less used makams of his period, reveals that his composition has come across a transitional phase.

## 1.2. Less Used Makams

According to the research of Çevikoğlu (2017: 20-22), it is stated that the number of makams that have been invented and used by composers throughout history is 600, and the number of makams that do not have a composition composed today is more than 300. According to the TRT archive, it is reported that the number of makams with examples in the repertoire is 286, and 41.96% (9.901 works) of 23,592 works composed from these 286 makams were composed by hicâz, nihâvend, huzzâm, râst, kurdîlihîcâzkar and uşşâk. Of the 600 makams estimated to have been used in the history of Turkish music, 20 makams, of which the number of works is 16,987 and that constitute 72% of the entire repertoire, are "hicaz, nihâvend, huzzâm, rast, kurdîlihîcâzkar, uşşâk, hüseyinî, mâhûr, muhayyerkürdî, hicâzkâr, karcıgar, sûznâk, sabâ, acemaşiran, acemkürdî, muhayyer, buselik, evc, bayâtî". Apart from these 20 makams, it is stated that the total of the works composed by the other 266 makams, of which we have examples, is 6,605, and the rate is 28%. It is stated that the total number of works in 167 makams, each of which has less than 10 exemplary works in the TRT repertoire, is only 452, and this number corresponds to 1.91% of the total repertoire.

In the study, it is noted that a large part of the total number of works in the repertoire belong to the 19th and 20th centuries. Çevikoğlu states that the fact that very few or no works were composed from these makams in the 19th and 20th centuries is not because most of the composers of the recent period did not like the makams, but because many works composed from these makams were forgotten because they were not recorded, and they were not known enough. It is stated that this situation is the same in terms of methods and forms.

Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey used makams such as nevrûz, hicâzzemzeme, evcmâye, büzürg, Şevkâver, tabrîz, zîrkeşîde, sabâzemzeme, nârefte, evchûzî, huseynîzemzeme, ısfadâzem, ısfadâmâm, the less used makams of his time, also composed works in more preferred makams such as hicâz, nihâvend, hicâzkar, kurdîlihîcâzkar.

17,883 works were recorded in the personal archive of Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey, which was transferred to the Ottoman Archives of the Republic of Turkey, Presidency of State Archives, and the number of compositions belonging to him is 3348 among these works, the works are reported according to their forms: 13 kâr, 12 kâr-ı natık, 15 nakış beste, 168 beste, 72 nakış ağır semâî, 77 yürük semâî, 1411 şarkı, 150 nakış yürük semâî, 2 müstezad yürük semâî, 4 mustezad, 12 halk şarkısı, 7 ninni, 92 ilahi, 1 nefes, 1 methiye, 27 tevşih, 2 şugul, 1 münacaat, 4 durak, 30 fantezi, 335 marş, 72 operet, 11 kanto, 159 peşrev, 220 saz semâîsi, 22 zeybek, 27 longa, 4 semaî, 14 sirto, 1 taksim, 18 köçek, 11 koşma, 1 mani, 4 mandıra, 11 oyun havası, 5 mazurka, 2 raksan, 7 polka, 39 vals, 6 bale, 1 bahariye, 1 tango, 4 dans, 3 dagı, 4 çengi, 1 atlı, 1 aksak semâî, 117 ağır nakış semâî, 8 duanâme, and it is reported that there are 137 more works, which are recorded as a non-recorded form and their type is not specified (Konan and Doğrusöz, 2017: 134; Konan, 2020: 36-37).

When we look at the works composed by Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey, it is seen that he preferred the less used makams of his period. Kamsoy stated that Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey revealed and introduced many forgotten makams and published the notation of many of them: "There were probably people who knew about these makams, but no one discovered them. Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey, like many of the old music masters, was not

one of those who kept his knowledge to himself, if he had not been a person who enjoyed spreading and teaching what he knew, this ground-breaking might not have been possible at all." Öztuna evaluated Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey's effort to compose works from makams that were not used and forgotten in his lifetime, as "he made a lot of works from dead makams by engaging in an effort unrelated to art, such as resurrecting some dead makams." In addition to this, he stated that he is a great composer and a great service to Turkish music by teaching hundreds of young people, establishing the Istanbul Operetta and publishing notes by giving concerts. Öztuna described the makams used by Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey in his works as follows;

"Acem, acemaşîrân, acembûselik, acemkürdî, acemzemzeme, arazbâr, arabân, arazbârbûselik, bayâti, bayâtîarabân, bayâtîarabân-bûselik, besteisfahân, bestenigâr, bûselik, bûzürg, cânfezâ, çârgâh, çârgâhda bûselik, çârgâhda rast, dilefrûz, dilkeşhâverân, dilnişîn, dügâh, evc, evcârâ, evcbûselik, evchûzî, evcmâye, ferahfezâ, ferahnâk, gerdâniye, gerdâniyebûselik, gerdâniyekürdî, gülizâr, hicâz, hicâzaşîrân, hicâzbûselik, hicâzî ırâk, hicâzkâr, hicâzzemzeme, hisârbûselik, hûzî, hümâyûn, hüseyinî, hüseyinâşîrân, hüseyinîzemzeme, hüzzâm, ırâk, ısfahân, ısfahânek, karcıgar, küçek, kürdî, kürdilhicâzkâr, mâhûr, mâhûrhân, mâye, muhâlif-i ırâk, muhayyer, muhayyerbûselik, muhayyerkürdî, muhayyersünbüle, müsteâr, nârefte, nevâ, nevâbûselik, nevâkürdî, nevâda uşşâk, neveser, nevrûz, nihâvend, nihâvend-i kebîr, nîkrîz, nişâbûr, nişâbûrek, nühöft, pençgâh, pesendîde, râhatfezâ, râhatülervâh, râst, râst-ı cedîd, rehâvî, sabâ, sabâbûselik, sabâzemzeme, sâzkâr, segâh, segâharabân, selmek, sipihr, sultânîhüzzâm, sultânîrâk, sultânîyegâh, sûzidîl, sûzidilârâ, sûznâk ve zengûleli sûznâk, sünbüle, şedarabân, şehnâz, şehnâzbûselik, şevkâver, şevkefzâ, şevk-ı cedîd, şevk-ı dil, şevkutarab, tâhir, tâhirbûselik, tarz-ı nevîn, tebrîz, uşşâk, uzzâl, vech-i arazbâr, yegâh, zâvil, zevkutarab and zîrkeşîde" (1990: 403-412). When we look at the given makam names, it is seen that there are many less used makams and even unknown makams today.

Öztuna quoted the works composed by Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey as 940 works, including 7 kâr, 1 kâr-ı natık, 38 beste, 48 ağır semâî, 48 yürük semâî, 505 şarkı (kanto, köçekçe, halk şarkısı, fantezi), 42 marş, 21 tevşih, 1 şugul, 33 ilahi, nefes, 1 durak and 15 operet, 34 peşrev, 69 saz semâîsi, 1 medhal and 75 oyun havası (1990: 412).

## 2. Method

In the study, the literature review method was used as a data collection method, which "helps to understand the research problem by selecting it and to put the research in a historical perspective" (Karasar, 1994: 183). Literature review is also a research method that "enables us to understand what kind of studies have been done in the field, the findings of previous studies, the methods they have used, their contributions to the field, and the points that have not been researched yet" (Karahasanoğlu and Yavuz, 2015: 21).

In this study, the makams with less than 90 works in the TRT repertoire were considered as "less used makams". All the works of Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey in the

TRT repertoire were examined, and the numerical data of the seldom-used makams were compared with the usage rates in both the composer's works and the TRT repertoire. In addition, some results were tried to be reached by giving examples about the completion of the missing fasıls composed from these makams.

### 3. Findings

When the TRT repertoire is examined, it is seen that the number of works belonging to Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey is 971. The table below shows the less used makams in the works of Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey in the TRT repertoire and the number of works belonging to these makams.

Table 1. The makams for which Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey composed one piece and their usage rate in the TRT repertoire

MAKAM NAME	MUALLİM İSMÂİL HAKKI BEY	TRT REPERTOIRE
Acemzemzeme	1	-
Arabânbüselik	1	4
Bayâtîarabân-büselik	1	5
Büzürg	1	31
Hicâzbüselik	1	9
Nârefte	1	1
Nevâkürdî	1	16
Nühüft	1	75
Sipîhr	1	36
Şehnâzârâ	1	-
Şevkâver	1	6
Zirkeşîde (Râst)	1	-
	12	183

Looking at the table above, it is seen that Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey composed 1 piece each from the makams in the table, and there is no work in the TRT repertoire from the makams of acemzemzeme, şehnâzârâ and zirkeşî (râst). Among the makams in the table, it is seen that 12 works out of 183 works in the TRT repertoire were composed by Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey.

Table 2. The makams for which Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey composed 2 pieces and their usage rates in the TRT repertoire

MAKAM NAME	MUALLİM İSMÂİL HAKKI BEY	TRT REPERTOIRE
Dilfırûz	2	4
Evcbüselik	2	30
Kûçek	2	17
Muhayyerbüselik	2	28
Nevâbüselik	2	39



Pesendide	2	31
Sabâbüselik	2	30
Sazkâr	2	53
Sultânîhüzzâm	2	6
Sûzidilârâ	2	51
Vech-i Arazbâr	2	11
Zevkutarab	2	4
	24	304

When the table is examined, it is seen that Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey composed 2 works from each of the makams in the table and the total number of 24 works has been reached, while the number of works composed from these makams is 304 in the TRT repertoire. It is noteworthy that the rate of use of makams such as zevkutarab, sultânîhüzzam, dilfiruz in the repertoire is very close to each other.

Table 3. The makams for which Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey composed 3 pieces and their usage rates in the TRT repertoire

MAKAM NAME	MUALLİM İSMÂİL HAKKI BEY	TRT REPERTOIRE
Acembûselik	3	40
Besteîsfahân	3	57
Cânfezâ	3	18
Evchûzî	3	11
Gerdâniyekürdî	3	3
Hicâzî Irâk	3	3
Hûzî	3	18
Isfahânek	3	14
Râst-ı Cedîd	3	26
	27	190

When the table above is evaluated, it is seen that the composer composed 3 pieces of works, 27 in total, and this number is 190 in the TRT repertoire. When the usage rates of the hicâzî irâk and gerdâniyekürdî makams are examined, it is noteworthy that the number of works composed by the composer and the number of works in the TRT repertoire are equal.

Table 4. The makams that Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey composed 4 pieces and their usage rates in the TRT repertoire

MAKAM NAME	MUALLİM İSMÂİL HAKKI BEY	TRT REPERTOIRE
Gerdâniyebûselik	4	12
Sabâzemzeme	4	68
Segâharabân(Sul. Segâh)	4	10
Selmek	4	11
Şevk-i Dîl	4	11
Şevkutarab	4	62

24

174

When the table is examined, it is seen that the composer composed 4 works from each of the makams in the table, and this number is 24 in total, and 174 works from these makams are registered in the TRT repertoire. It is noticed that the number of works in makams such as şevk-i dil, selmek, segâharabân (sul. segâh), gerdâniyebûselik are close to each other when the rate of use in the TRT repertoire is considered.

Table 5. The makams for which Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey composed 5 pieces and their usage rates in the TRT repertoire

MAKAM NAME	MUALLİM İSMÂİL HAKKI BEY	TRT REPERTOIRE
Arazbârbûselik	5	47
Dilnişin	5	10
Mâye	5	69
Nihâvend-i Kebîr	5	17
Tarz-ı Nevîn	5	39
	25	182

When the table is examined, it is seen that the composer composed 5 pieces of each of the above makams and this number is 25 in total. In the TRT repertoire, there are 182 works from these makams. It is noticed that the usage rates of dilnişin and nihâvend-i kebîr in the table are close to each other.

Table 6. The makams in which Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey composed 6 or more pieces and their usage rates in the TRT repertoire

MAKAM NAME	MUALLİM İSMÂİL HAKKI BEY	TRT REPERTOIRE
Mâhûrhân	7	-
Hicâzzemzeme	8	4
Muhayyersünbûle	8	77
Hüseynizemzeme	10	13
Nevrûz	11	21
Rehâvî	11	67
Tehrîz	17	27
	72	209

When the makams in the table are examined, it is seen that the number of works composed by the composer from these makams is 72 in total, and 209 works from these makams are registered in the TRT repertoire. When the number of works is compared, it is noticed that they are close to each other in number. When we look at the number of works in the makam of "mahûrhân", which Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey composed, in the TRT repertoire, it is seen that there are only works belonging to the composer.

When the above tables are evaluated in general, it is seen that Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey composed 184 pieces from 51 makams that are rarely used, and the number of works composed from these makams in the TRT repertoire is 1242. (While calculating these

rates, the works composed by the composer from rarely used makams are not included in the TRT repertoire.). It is noteworthy that in the paintings, there are no works composed other than the works of Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey, one of the makams such as mahûrhân, zirkeşîde, şehnâzârâ and acemzemzeme, and that the majority of the works composed with zevkutarab, vech-i arazbâr, tebrîz, şevk-i dîl, şevkâver, sultânîhüzzâm, selmek, segâharabân (sultânîsegâh), nevrûz, nârefte, kûçek, ısfahâne, hüseyîzemzeme, hicâzî ırâk, hicâzzemzeme, hicâzbûselik, gerdâniyebûselik, gerdâniyekürdî, evchûzî, dilnişîn, dilfirûz, bayâtîarabân-bûselik and arabân-bûselik makams belong to Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey. When the number of works composed by Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey from rarely used makams is compared with the number of works in the TRT repertoire, it is understood from the tables that the composer's works are quite high.

Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey, besides composing works from rarely used makams, is also considered very important, especially his work on the completion of classical fasıls composed from these makams.

### 3.1. “Completing a Fasil” in the Composition Understanding of Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey

It can be seen as an incomplete evaluation to describe the fact that Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey composed many works from rarely used makams as a personal preference for composition. What is important in Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey's understanding of composition is to complete the works required for the performance, rather than who the works to be performed belong to, and thus to ensure that the cultural memory of the music is transferred without interruption. It is possible to come across the most obvious examples of these "completion" activities in the Mevlevî rites.

In the Mevlevî tradition, rites are works composed for the sama mukabele, and many rite composers did not mind adapting some parts from another rite that was composed before them for a new rite they would compose (if it was appropriate for the makam, usûl and lyrics). Because the essential thing for Mevlevî composers is the search for truth through the teachings of Mevlana. Therefore, it is important for the Mevlevîs to display the wise messages to be conveyed with the sema in the beauty they deserve, rather than by whom the music performed during the response was composed. This attitude, in which the sense of self is postponed, reveals a worldview in which pluralism is at the center, in parallel with the general understanding of the Mevlevî. Many Mevlevî composers did not compose the peşrev, son peşrev and son yürük semâî parts of the rituals themselves. For the relevant sections, they either used the existing works of other composers or ordered a composer to compose these sections. For example, the last prelude to Dede Mehmed Zekâî Efendi's mevlavî ritual in the sûzidil makam was composed by Raûf Yekta Bey, and the peşrev at the beginning of Celaleddin Dede's dügâh makam was composed by Hüseyin Fahreddin Dede.

With a similar approach, there are also "completed" works in classical fasıls. Throughout history, many classical pieces were left incomplete because they were forgotten during the transmission through meşk, and therefore they became

unperformable, so some lost works in the classical section of a composer were composed by another composer in a style similar to the original version, and the related section was performed.

It is understood that Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey also completed many incomplete fasıls with this understanding and gave importance to completing the sets, especially in the less-used makams. There are examples where Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey provided the completion of the fasıl by composing the missing pieces of a classical section belonging to another composer, as well as examples where he provided the formation of a new team in the tebrîz makam by composing works in the form of murabbâ and aksak semâî on yürük semâî by Rabbi Nesim Civilya. The fact that Özalp (1986: 35) mentions that Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey completed the missing pieces of instrumental and lyric works in that makam in order to introduce the fasıls in unknown makams, confirms this information.

These works of Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey, to convey the tradition correctly, were appreciated by the music community during his lifetime. There were also points of criticism. Today, it has been a guide by inspiring many studies.

### 3. Results

When we look at all of Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey's works such as composition, education, ensemble director, and notation writing, it is noticed that he made a great effort to transfer the tradition. The last periods of the Ottoman Empire and the first years of the Republic are the most uncertain times of cultural identity changes. Many music people who have realized this period have performed their works in this "uncertainty" environment. Music is one of the areas most affected by the preference for Western culture, which started with the Tanzimat Reform Era and continued in the founding period of the Second Constitutional Monarchy and the Republic. In this process, the tides between tradition and innovation caused many difficulties in terms of the technique and transmission of music. In addition to the compositions made in order not to be indifferent to the popular new music forms that started to appear with the changing music perception in this period, new works produced for the continuity of the ancient composition types transferred by tradition also attract attention. On the one hand, the makams that began to be expressed with tonality, on the other hand, the less-used makams that were composed in order not to be forgotten, on the other hand, the difficulties in writing them using European notation are among the prominent problems of this chaotic period. Being in the middle of all these uncertainties, Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey was able to reflect the period he lived in as it was, therefore he composed *kanto*, *fokstrot*, *marş*, and *operet* as well as *pesrev*, *kâr*, *murabbâ*, *sazsemâîsi*, *longa*, *sirto*.

When the compositions of Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey are examined, it is easily understood that the preferred makams are mostly rarely used and forgotten ones. This attitude is not only a personal and artistic preference of the composer, but also an indication of his sense of duty in conveying the tradition. Just like Mehmed Zekâî Efendi

(Zekâî Dede), who composed a set of the sipihr makam, which he realized was rarely used in his own time, and conveyed the lyrics of his yürük semâî, especially including the description of the makam, Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey, with a similar mission, composed hundreds of works from forgotten makams in his own time. Evaluating this activity, as Öztuna puts it, "by engaging in an effort unrelated to art, such as resurrecting some dead (forgotten) makams, he made a lot of works from dead makams" is an admission that the issue has not been properly understood.

Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey ensured that thousands of works belonging to different composers were transferred to the present day with his handwriting, and during these transfers, he recomposed works that were forgotten in time by imitating the style of his composer in order to complete the fasıl. Thus, it not only prevented the oblivion of related works and makams, but also enabled the transfer of the classical fasıl tradition. We believe that it would be more appropriate to consider all these as "an effort to preserve the connection between the past and the future" rather than as "an effort unrelated to art", as Öztuna stated.

The scientific and artistic works belonging to Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey attract the attention of many researchers working in the field of theory, composition, and performance, and it is hoped that these studies will increase.

### Acknowledgements

This article was generated from the Proficiency in Art Thesis titled; " The Examination of Classical Set in Nevruz Makam by Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey in Terms of Musical Elements", which is being prepared at Afyon Kocatepe University Graduate School of Social Sciences Department of Music in Turkey.

### References

- Aksoy, B. (1985). *Tanzimat'tan Cumhuriyet'e Mûsikî ve Batılılaşma*. Tanzimat'tan Cumhuriyet'e Türkiye Ansiklopedisi (*Music and Westernization from the Tanzimat to the Republic*) Encyclopedia of Turkey from the Tanzimat to the Republic. İstanbul: İletişim Publishing.
- Aksu, F. A. (1988). *Abdûlbâki Nâsır Dede Tetkik ü Tahkik*. (Unpublished Master's Thesis). Marmara University Institute of Social Sciences, İstanbul.
- Aksüt, S. (1993). *Türk Musikisinin 100 Bestekârı (100 Composers of Turkish Music)*. İstanbul: İnkılâp Bookstre.
- Bardakçı, M. (2017). *Safiye*. İstanbul: Türkiye İş Bankası Kültür Publishing.
- Behar, C. (1993). *Zaman, Mekân, Müzik (Time, Place, Music)*. İstanbul: Afa Publishing.
- Yapı Kredi Publishing.
- Behar, C. (2019). *Aşk Olmayınca Meşk Olmaz*. İstanbul: Kredi Publishing

- Çetin, N. (2014). İstiklâl Marşı'mızı Anlamak (Understanding Our National Anthem). *Ankara University Faculty of Language, History and Geography Journal of Turcology*, 21, 2, 25-92. [https://doi.org/10.1501/Trkol\\_0000000286](https://doi.org/10.1501/Trkol_0000000286)
- Çevikoğlu, T. (2017). *Bir Hayâlin Peşinde-Klâsik Türk Müziği Yazıları. (Classical Turkish Music Writings-I)*. Ankara: Edebiyat Ortamı Publishing.
- Duran, M. H. (2001). "Millî Mecmua" Ve "Tiyatro ve Mûsikî" Adlı Dergilerdeki Türk Mûsikîsi ile İlgili Makaleler (Articles Related to Turkish Music in the Magazines "Millî Mecmua" and "Theater and Music"). (Unpublished Master's Thesis). Marmara University Institute of Social Sciences. İstanbul.
- Gazimihal, M. R. (2017). *Anadolu Türküleri ve Musikî İstikbâlimiz (Anatolian Folk Songs and Our Musical Future)*. Prep. Metin Özarslan (2nd Edition). İstanbul: Doğu Library.
- Güçtekin, N. (2014). *İsmail Hakkı Bey ve Osmanlı Devleti'nde İlk Özel Mûsikî Okulu: Mûsikî Osmanî Mektebi (1910-1920) (İsmail Hakkı Bey and the First Private Music School in the Ottoman Empire: Mûsikî Osmanî School 1910-1920)*. *Rast Journal of Musicology Volume II*, 1-18. <https://doi.org/10.12975/rastmd.2014.02.01.00028>
- Güntekin, M. (2010). *İstanbul'un 100 Musikişinası-17 (Istanbul's 100 Musicians-17)*. İstanbul: İstanbul Metropolitan Municipality Kültür A.Ş. Publishing.
- İnal, İ. M. K. (2019). *Hoş Sadâ, Son Asır Türk Musikişinasları (Hoş Sadâ, Turkish Musicians of the Last Century)*. İstanbul: Ketebe Publishing.
- Kamsoy, M. M. (1971). *Muallim İsmail Hakkı Bey'e Dâir. Musiki ve Nota (About Muallim İsmail Hakkı Bey. Music ve Note)*, Cilt: 2, 19.
- Karahasanoğlu, S. and Yavuz, E. D. (2015). *Müzikte Araştırma Yöntemleri (Research Methods in Music)*. İstanbul: İstanbul Technical University Turkish Music State Conservatory Publishing.
- Karasar, N. (1994). *Bilimsel Araştırma Yöntemi (Scientific Research Method)*. Ankara: Research Education Consultancy Ltd.
- Kaygusuz, N. (2006). *Muallim İsmail Hakkı Bey ve Mûsikî Tekâmül Dersleri (Muallim İsmail Hakkı Bey and Mûsikî Tekâmül Lessons)*. İstanbul: İTÜ Vakfı Publishing.
- Konan, D. and Doğrusöz, N. (2017). *Osmanlı'dan Cumhuriyet'e Esâtiz-i Elhânımızın Ser-Firâzı: İsmail Hakkı Bey (Ser-Firâz of Our Esâtiz-i Elhân from the Ottoman Empire to the Republic: İsmail Hakkı Bey)*. *International Republic Art Days*, April, 2017, (p.132-138). Sivas: Cumhuriyet University. [file:///Users/ozlemelitas/Downloads/ULUSLARARASI\\_CUMHURİYET\\_SANAT\\_GUNLERI\\_TA.pdf](file:///Users/ozlemelitas/Downloads/ULUSLARARASI_CUMHURİYET_SANAT_GUNLERI_TA.pdf)
- Konan, S.D. (2020). *Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey; Hayatı ve Dini Musiki Formlarındaki Eserleri Üzerine Bir İnceleme (Muallim İsmâîl Hakkı Bey; A Study on His Life and His Works in Religious Music Forms)*. (Unpublished Doctoral Dissertation). Marmara University Social Sciences University, İstanbul.
- Özalp, M. N. (1986). *Türk Mûsikîsi Tarihi Cilt I-II (Turkish Music History Volume I-II)*. Ankara: TRT Music Department Publishing.
- Öztuna, Y. (1990). *Büyük Türk Mûsikîsi Ansiklopedisi Cilt I (Great Encyclopedia of Turkish Music Vol. I)*. Ankara: Ministry of Culture Publishing.
- Tura, Y. (2001). *Kitabu'İlmi'l-Musiki 'ala vechi'l-Hurufat*. Yapı Kredi Publishing.

- Tura, Y. (2006). *Nâsır Abdülbâkî Dede, İnceleme ve Gerçeği Araştırma, Tedkik ü Tahkik (Nâsır Abdülbâkî Dede, Investigation and Researching the Truth, Tedkik ü Tahkik)*. İstanbul: Pan Publishing.
- Tıraşcı, M. (2014). Türk Mûsikisinde Duânâme Formu ve Eserleri (The Duanâme Form and Its Works In Turkish Music). *Dicle Üniversitesi İlahiyat Fakültesi Dergisi*, 16, 2. [http://isamveri.org/pdfdrg/D02042/2014\\_2/2014\\_2\\_TIRASCIM.pdf](http://isamveri.org/pdfdrg/D02042/2014_2/2014_2_TIRASCIM.pdf)
- Yeniğün, H. (1971). İsmail Hakkı Bey (Muallim). *Musiki ve Nota (İsmail Hakkı Bey (Muallim))*. *Music and Note*, 13.

#### Web

- Ayangil, R. (2015). Kişisel ve Toplumsal Boyutta Türk Makam Müziğini Anlama ve Temsil Sorunsalı, Kültür Söyleşileri (The Problem of Understanding and Representing Turkish Makam Music in Personal and Social Dimensions, Cultural Interviews). Ankara: Atatürk Cultural Center Presidency. <https://www.akmb.gov.tr/Bilgi.aspx?ID=254> [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Dt1jA\\_2aymE](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=Dt1jA_2aymE) (Retrieved in: 20.09.2020)
- Bardakçı, M. (2019). Osmanlı İmparatorluğunu Teşkil Eden Milletler İçin Yapılmış Ama Hiç Çalınmamış Besteler Albümü, Habertürk (Album of Compositions Made for the Nations Forming the Ottoman Empire But Never Played, Habertürk). 03.03.2019, <https://www.haberturk.com/yazarlar/murat-bardakci/2390800-osmanli-imparatorlugunu-teskil-eden-milletler-icin-yapilmis-ama-hic-calinmamis-bir-besteler-albumu> (Retrieved in: 10.09.2020).

---

#### Copyrights

Copyright for this article is retained by the author(s), with first publication rights granted to the Journal.

This is an open-access article distributed under the terms and conditions of the Creative Commons Attribution license (CC BY-NC-ND) (<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-nc-nd/4.0/>).